

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS**

AMERICAN FREEDOM DEFENSE  
INITIATIVE; PAMELA GELLER; and  
ROBERT SPENCER,

Plaintiffs,

-v.-

MASSACHUSETTS BAY TRANSPORTATION  
AUTHORITY (“MBTA”); and BEVERLY A.  
SCOTT, individually and in her official capacity as  
Chief Executive Officer / General Manager of the  
MBTA,

Defendants.

Case No. 1:13-cv-12803-NMG

**NOTICE OF APPEAL**

Notice is hereby given that the American Freedom Defense Initiative, Pamela Geller, and Robert Spencer, the plaintiffs in the above-named matter, hereby appeal to the United States Court of Appeals for the First Circuit from the Memorandum & Order (Doc. No. 32), which was entered in this action on December 20, 2013, denying plaintiffs’ motion for a preliminary injunction.

Respectfully submitted,

**AMERICAN FREEDOM LAW CENTER**

/s/ Robert J. Muise

Robert J. Muise, Esq.\* (MI P62849)

P.O. Box 131098

Ann Arbor, Michigan 48113

[rmuise@americanfreedomlawcenter.org](mailto:rmuise@americanfreedomlawcenter.org)

Tel: (734) 635-3756; Fax: (801) 760-3901

/s/ David Yerushalmi

David Yerushalmi, Esq.\* (DC # 978179)

1901 Pennsylvania Avenue NW, Suite 201

Washington, D.C. 20006

[dyerushalmi@americanfreedomlawcenter.org](mailto:dyerushalmi@americanfreedomlawcenter.org)

Tel: (646) 262-0500; Fax: (801) 760-3901

\* Admitted *pro hac vice*

/s/ Robert Snider  
Robert Snider, Esq. (BBO#471000)  
11 Cahill Park Drive  
Framingham, Massachusetts 01702  
[robert.snider20@gmail.com](mailto:robert.snider20@gmail.com)  
Tel/Fax: (508) 875-0003

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on December 30, 2013, a copy of the foregoing was filed electronically. Notice of this filing will be sent to all parties for whom counsel has entered an appearance by operation of the Court's electronic filing system. Parties may access this filing through the Court's system. I further certify that a copy of the foregoing has been served by ordinary U.S. mail upon all parties for whom counsel has not yet entered an appearance electronically: none.

**AMERICAN FREEDOM LAW CENTER**

/s/ Robert J. Muise  
Robert J. Muise, Esq.